

**DOCUMENT OF THE EUROPEAN BANK FOR
RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT**

**EXTRACTIVE MINING INDUSTRIES STRATEGY
2018-2022**

**REPORT ON THE
INVITATION TO THE PUBLIC TO COMMENT**

Table of Contents

Introduction 1

1. Summary of the consultation process 2

 a. Public consultation meetings 2

 b. Bilateral consultation meetings 3

 c. Written comments 4

2. Summary of key comments 4

3. EBRD responses 6

Annex I: Stakeholders consulted 8

Annex II: Comments received during the consultation period 10

Extractive Mining Industries Strategy 2018-2022

Report on the invitation to the public to comment

Introduction

The Extractive Mining Industries Strategy (the “Strategy”) builds on the EBRD’s initial Mining Operations Policy approved in 2012. It recognises changes that have taken place in the sector over the last five years, bearing in mind developments both within the Bank’s mining-intensive countries of operations and within the sector globally. These developments include initiatives aimed at improving the environmental and social performance of the mining sector, new health and safety practices, climate change issues, the transparency of revenue flows and contracts, and the role of local communities. The new Strategy will guide the EBRD’s operational priorities in the mining sector for the period 2018-2022.

In accordance with the Bank’s Public Information Policy, the EBRD invited the public to comment on the draft Strategy. The draft document was disclosed on the EBRD website from 6 October until 20 November 2017 in English, Mongolian, Russian, Turkish, Arabic and French, at www.ebrd.com/strategies-and-policies/have-your-say.html.

The EBRD widely notified stakeholders of the publication of the draft Strategy. It was shared directly with key partners and stakeholders, among which were civil society organisations (CSOs), including non-governmental organisations (NGOs), academia and research centres, international and multilateral organisations, bilateral cooperation agencies, government institutions and municipalities, as well as private sector representatives, business associations, and consultants (listed in Annex I).

In addition to soliciting written comments, the EBRD organised a series of public consultation meetings starting in London in July 2017 (before the publication of the draft Strategy) and then in Ulaanbaatar, Almaty, and Istanbul in October 2017. The meetings provided an opportunity for stakeholders to express their views and to provide input related to their respective fields of expertise, with regard to the revision of the draft Strategy. The company Metrica Relocations Plus was selected as an implementing partner to assist the EBRD in the organisation of the consultation meetings.

This report comprises a summary of the consultation process, key comments received, and the EBRD’s responses to the comments. The comments have all been reviewed and reflected in the revised Strategy where applicable. Annex I presents a list of stakeholders consulted; Annex II provides a detailed list of all comments collected during the consultation process and corresponding EBRD responses.

1. Summary of the consultation process

The consultation process took the form of: a) public consultation meetings, b) bilateral meetings and c) written comments. The meetings were attended by a broad range of stakeholders including CSOs, NGOs, international and multilateral organisations, bilateral cooperation agencies, government institutions, municipalities, academia, research centres, private sector representatives, business associations and consultants. The Bank's independent Environmental and Social Advisory Council (ESAC) held a discussion on the proposed draft Mining Strategy on 21 November 2017. The discussion and written comments received from ESAC during the public comment period were considered in the finalisation of the revised Mining Strategy. Annex I includes details of the stakeholders consulted.

a. Public consultation meetings

The EBRD invited comments on the draft Extractive Mining Industries Strategy at four public consultation meetings. The first of these was held before the publication of the draft Strategy, and was based on the existing 2012 Mining Operations Policy. The three subsequent meetings were held following the publication of the new draft Strategy. A broad range of civil society organisations were represented at the public consultations. Table 1 below provides an overview of these meetings and relevant details, including the number of participants.

Date	Location	Number of attendees
28 July 2017	London, United Kingdom	22
11 October 2017	Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia	41
25 October 2017	Almaty, Kazakhstan	18
30 October 2017	Istanbul, Turkey	27

Table 2 summarises the diversity of those that attended the consultation meetings. Of the 374 organisations invited to the four public consultations, 108 representatives attended from nine different countries. Almost half of all participants represented CSOs, including NGOs and national and international foundations (51). The next largest group was formed by representatives of private sector companies, business associations or sector expert consultants (32), followed by those from academic institutions (17). Four (4) people attended on behalf of international/multilateral organisations and IFIs, two (2) represented governmental institutions and two (2) participated as representatives of bilateral cooperation agencies. There was a balanced representation of men (58) and women (50) participants.

Eighteen potential participants submitted requests for financial support to participate in the public consultation meetings. Eight were selected and funding granted, based on pre-established criteria administered by Metrica Relocations Plus.

Table 2: Number of attendees by country of residence and type of organisation

	Women	Men	Government institutions / municipalities	Academia (universities, research centres, think tanks)	NGOs / CSOs / national and international foundations	Bilateral cooperation agencies / embassies	International / multilateral organisations, IFIs,	Private sector: business associations, consultants
Azerbaijan		1			1			
Bulgaria		1			1			
Georgia		2			2			
Kazakhstan	10	7		2	9		2	4
Kyrgyzstan	1				1			
Mongolia	18	23	1	9	20		1	10
Turkey	10	13	1	2	7			13
UK	10	11		4	9	2	1	5
US	1				1			
Total (108)	50	58	2	17	51	2	4	32

The public consultation meetings on the draft Strategy followed the same agenda consistently in all three locations selected in the Bank's countries of operations. They began with an overview of the draft Strategy, outlining the proposed operational approach of the Bank. This included the background and strategic context, rationale, scope and structure of the draft Strategy. It was followed by an overview of the Bank's activities in the mining sector, and lessons learned. After some clarification questions, the presentation continued elaborating on the Bank's envisaged approach and operational priorities in the forthcoming strategy period, including the approach to addressing remaining transition challenges in the Bank's countries of operations through the six transition impact qualities, as well as the envisaged performance monitoring framework. Country-specific examples were presented. The session concluded with comments and discussion on the topics presented.

The second session took the form of working groups and was dedicated to the key topic areas and transition qualities of relevance for the mining sector (governance and transparency; inclusion, gender and human rights; sustainability and environment issues; economic developments, competitiveness and innovation). The final session consisted of one volunteer from each working group presenting their conclusions and recommendations on the given topic, followed by reactions from EBRD presenters and concluding remarks.

b. Bilateral consultation meetings

Table 3 provides a list of the bilateral consultation meetings and the dates on which these took place.

Table 3: List of bilateral consultation meetings		
Date	Location	Organisation
11 July 2017	London, United Kingdom	- EITI - ICMM
11 October 2017	Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia	- Australia-Mongolia Extractives Program - The Nature Conservancy - Mongolia EITI Secretariat - Mongolia Economic Forum - Mongolian National Mining Association - Economic Policy and Competitiveness Research Center - Mongolian University of Science and Technology - Mongolian National Chamber of Commerce and Industry
12 October 2017	Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia	- Erdene Resource Development Corporation - Kincora/Terracom/Tarva - Oyu Tolgoi - Mineral Resource and Petroleum Authority of Mongolia
25 October 2017	Almaty, Kazakhstan	- "Damu" Entrepreneurship Development Fund" JSC - Mineral Exploration Consultants Ltd./PONEN
26 October 2017	Almaty, Kazakhstan	- Asian Development Bank - Shalkia Zinc
30 October 2017	Istanbul, Turkey	- Turkish Gold Miners Association - Yildirim Group - Yildirim Holding INC - Tuprag Metal Madencilik A.Ş - Turkish Miners Association - DEIK
31 October 2017	Istanbul, Turkey	- Nurol Holding - CEE Bankwatch

c. Written comments

The draft Strategy was released in English on the EBRD website on 6 October 2017 and was open for written comments for 45 calendar days until 20 November 2017. The draft Strategy was also posted online in English, Mongolian, Russian, Turkish, Arabic and French languages during the consultation period. Written comments were received from fourteen (14) organisations based in various regions and with different fields of expertise.

2. Summary of key comments

The comments received in the course of the consultation period were comprehensive and covered all aspects of the Extractive Mining Industries Strategy. A number of observations were raised by multiple stakeholders, and these key comments are summarised below, categorised by topic, country/region, or

generally applicable across the Strategy. Annex II presents a detailed table of all comments compiled during the public consultation, including the input received in the meetings and via written submission, as well as responses by EBRD management. As is standard EBRD practice, the commentators' identities are not disclosed for confidentiality reasons.

Many of the comments received were related to basic clarifications of the scope and strategic directions of the Strategy: for example, the fact that the Strategy does not cover the financing of thermal coal and uranium. In all public consultation discussions, a significant number of cross-cutting comments were repeated across all four locations. They included: environmental and social impacts; inclusion issues, issues related to human rights and labour standards; the quality of governance and the level of transparency in the Bank's countries of operations; and innovation and technology transfer.

- *Environmental and social impacts:* Most comments received in this area concerned issues that are governed by the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy. Comments pointed to the need to carefully assess potential environmental and social impacts of mining operations, weighing expected benefits and potential risks. Comments also emphasised the need to improve baseline analyses and consider life-cycle issues, including mine reclamation and remediation; continuous monitoring of the environmental and social impacts of mining operations is also necessary, especially with regard to closure and decommissioning.
- *Inclusion and gender related issues:* Encouraging female employment and the participation of disadvantaged groups in the mining sector represents a challenge, which the Bank should help address through its new Extractive Mining Industries Strategy, according to many comments received.
- *Labour standards and occupational health:* Comments indicated that there are significant discrepancies in labour standards across EBRD's countries of operations. This has led to substantial variance in occupational health and safety performance, which the Bank should address in a streamlined approach.
- *Good governance and transparency:* Consultation participants emphasised the significant governance, accountability and transparency challenges that the mining sector faces. They advised that the Strategy should incorporate the 2016 Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI) standard as one of the tools for promoting greater transparency, paying particular attention to the commitment to beneficial ownership disclosure and contract transparency. The Strategy should also incorporate international standards on responsible sourcing and supply-chain issues.
- *Innovation, technology and knowledge transfer:* Some comments received encouraged the Bank to support research and development activities, which are a bottleneck for the mining sector. In addition, the Bank should contribute to the development of local sector expertise, by providing training and knowledge transfer opportunities. The Bank should also provide more support to small and medium-sized enterprises, which encounter more substantial challenges than established international mining corporations.

A number of comments focused on specific issues pertaining to the Bank's transition impact qualities (see Annex II of comments received for further details).

Some comments related to specific countries or regions, examples of which are listed below:

- *Mongolia:*
 - Consultation participants were concerned that government instability or lack of continuity due to frequent changes of government hinders policy making and implementation. Recommendations made by civil society are often not considered by policy makers.
 - The current legal environment does not allow for adequate handling of environmental challenges, in particular mine remediation/reclamation.
 - The impact of mining on traditional (nomadic) lifestyles needs to be carefully considered.
 - Widespread artisanal mining represents a challenge for the application of sector-wide labour standards.

- *Kazakhstan:*
 - The mining sector faces significant challenges regarding corporate governance and transparency/accountability standards.

- *Mongolia and Kazakhstan*
 - Local communities as well as sector experts would benefit substantially from improved vocational training, which would also support economic diversification efforts.

- *Turkey:*
 - Alignment with international operational standards: Currently there are competing standards (e.g. Turkey's UMREK, Australia's COR), which can expose gaps in the application of labour and human rights standards, such as in the example of mining in marble, which plays a significant role in Turkey.

3. EBRD responses

The present report contains a record both of the written comments received by email from diverse stakeholders and of the comments discussed during the public and bilateral consultation meetings. The EBRD has reviewed these comments for relevant impacts on the draft Strategy.

A detailed list of the comments collected and the EBRD's response to each point are contained in Annex II. The types of contribution are twofold, and related responses have been provided accordingly: 1) comments raised for clarification purposes are addressed by relevant explanations, and 2) comments containing suggestions on the content and format of the Strategy have been considered in the review and revision of the draft Strategy.

To avoid any repetition, the comments have been organised by theme, with one common response covering similar questions. The EBRD has used a consistent approach in its responses. Length and complexity of

responses vary depending on the context of each consultation meeting, the complexity of the questions and how they relate to the Strategy. The length of each answer does not reflect the importance or otherwise of the question asked.

The EBRD believes that the draft Extractive Mining Industries Strategy has greatly benefited from this consultation period. The Bank is appreciative of the time and effort invested by many to help improve the document, and thanks all contributors for their comments.

Annex I: Stakeholders consulted

(List of organisations that participated in public consultation meetings or submitted written comments)

Country	Name of organisation
Kazakhstan	CEE Bankwatch Network
	Center for Introduction of New Environmentally Safe Technologies
	Coalition of Green Economy/Expo&Women
	Echo Public Association
	Ecoaction
	Eurasia Foundation of Central Asia
	Financial Freedom
	Nazarbayev University, Department of Mining Engineering
	PF "Civil Expertise"
	PF Socio-Ecological Fund
	Public Policy Research Center
	Tabiyat Ecological Movement of Kyrgyzstan
	The Youth Public Union “Damu”
Mongolia	Bayansharga NGO
	Centre for Human Rights and Development
	Centre for Policy Research
	Globe International
	Institute of Geology and Mining
	Kincora Copper
	Mongolian Environmental Citizen’s Council
	Mongolian International University
	Mongolian National Mining Association
	Mongolian Nature and Environment Consortium
	Mongolian Nature and Natural Resources Foundation
	Mongolian University of Science and Technology, School of Geology and Mining
	Movement of Khuvsgul lake's owners
	MPIGM
	New settle, healthy and safe area
	Open Society Forum
	Sant Maral Foundation
	SESMIM
	Sustainability
	The Asia Foundation
The Nature Conservancy	

	Transparency Foundation
	WWF
	Zorig Foundation
Turkey	Association for Farmers Rights Defence
	Association for Innovative Collaboration (YIMEDER)
	CEE Bankwatch Network
	Chamber of Mining Engineers Istanbul
	Ecological Society "Ruzgar",
	Istanbul University Mining Engineering Faculty
	Nilufer Kent Konseyi / Nilufer Municipality
	Publish What You Pay
	Social Risk Management Consulting (SRM)
	The Turkish Foundation for Combating Soil Erosion, for Reforestation and the Protection of Natural Habitats (TEMA)
	World Experience for Georgia
	WWF, CO-SEED
United Kingdom/ International	Aarhus Convention Secretariat
	Crude Accountability
	Better Sourcing Programme
	Business and Human Rights Resource Centre
	CEE Bankwatch Network
	Centre for Energy Law – University of Aberdeen
	Chatham House - The Royal Institute of International Affairs
	Climate Strategies
	Conservation International
	Flora and Fauna International
	Natural Resource Governance Institute
	Publish What You Pay Coalition
	Skarn Associates
	Smith School of Enterprise and the Environment - University of Oxford
	Transparency International UK
	Women in Mining

Annex II: Comments received during the consultation period

No.	Comments received	Source of comment ¹	EBRD responses
Key comments on the rationale and scope of the Strategy			
1	EBRD should ensure that the projects it finances do not support child labour, which can be an issue in small scale artisanal mining.	Ulaanbaatar	EBRD projects do not include artisanal mining. Therefore the Bank is limited in its influence on that sector. The Bank's Environmental and Social Policy prohibits supporting any activities that may employ child labour.
2	More investment and other support should be provided for small scale mining efforts. Geological expertise is needed because many small scale companies do not have sufficient capacity to meet international best practice standards, they are also faced with increased costs of mining operations which hinders development and reduces competitiveness. EBRD should invest in smaller and medium size ventures in areas like nickel or in new minerals like potassium. The Strategy should prioritise support for smaller mining companies that have less capacity to align with social and environmental standards in order to enable greater environmental action by smaller players.	London Almaty Ulaanbaatar written	The Bank's policies and requirements apply to all investment projects, regardless of the size of the company. Details of EBRD financial support for mining companies of different sizes and specialisations are on slide 17 of the Strategy.
3	The geo-technology of underground borehole leaching of useful components should be developed and disseminated in the global mining industry. This should be applied not only for uranium, but also for the entire spectrum of non-ferrous metals.	written	Comment noted.

¹ A city name indicates a public consultation or bilateral meeting; 'written' indicates that a comment was received in writing.

4	<p>The Bank should be particularly cautious in operations that involve coking coal as in the EBRD region coking coal is often mixed with steam coal.</p>	written	<p>The use of thermal coal is not specifically addressed in the Mining Strategy, although as noted in the Strategy document, the Bank does not finance thermal coal mining operations other than health and safety, and operational safety improvements, or mine remediation - no proceeds would be assigned to enhancing production capacity, or general capex. The Bank includes an assessment of coking coal versus thermal coal as part of project appraisal.</p>
5	<p>Coal mining and its use should not be treated separately. Coal mining, sustainability and transition to a low-carbon economy cannot go hand-in-hand. Bank should decide which way they go forward.</p>	written	<p>The 2013 Energy Strategy, which is planned to be revised in 2018, addresses carbon-related issues such as the impact of thermal coal combustion on climate change, its role in the energy mix and its contribution to energy security in some of the Bank's countries of operation. Investments in coal fired generation are excluded, except in rare and exceptional cases. All projects are assessed against the criteria for coal-fired projects as set out in the 2013 Energy Sector Strategy and the requirements of the Bank's 2014 Environmental and Social Policy. The Bank's policies and strategies, including the new Mining Strategy, work in conjunction.</p>
6	<p>Bank is called to completely stop financing coal mining projects. There is no room whatsoever for new or extended support for fossil fuel extraction and production.</p>	written	<p>The Bank may only finance coking coal projects where the mined coal is used in steel production in line with the provisions of the new Mining Strategy. Such projects would only be financed if they satisfy transition criteria and comply with all of the Bank's Governance Policies. The Mining Strategy does not cover thermal coal projects for use in energy production.</p>

7	EBRD should include an additional specific objective to the Strategy: "increased investment in nature conservation."	written	The EBRD invests primarily in private sector industrial projects that are 'bankable'. All projects are appraised against risks to biodiversity and include the principle of 'No Net Loss' of biodiversity and habitat. Issues relating to biodiversity are managed through the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy.
8	The Bank should include environmental and social provisions, not only fiscal terms and conditions, in the summary of key terms and conditions.	written	The Bank includes environmental and social provisions, which are part of EBRD Performance requirements, in its loan covenants.
9	Add the word "rehabilitation" under the title Green on slide 7 to "will require careful adaptation & mitigation at every stage of the project".	written	This has been reflected in the Strategy text.
10	Add the following bullet point: "Outdated prospecting data, it is recommended to undertake new exploration" in the box of the Profile of the mining sector economy under the category of 'Competitive', Mining Country Snapshot: Georgia.	written Georgia	Comment noted. This has been changed in the revised Strategy.
General and cross-cutting comments			
11	It is important to reflect the developments from the 2013 Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI) standard to the 2016 EITI standard in the new Strategy, especially with regard to the commitment to beneficial ownership disclosure, contract transparency, etc.	London Almaty written	The Bank requires the companies it works with to comply with highest standards of transparency and revenue reporting. In addition, one year from the date of the approval of the new mining Strategy, the Bank will require its mining clients to make public relevant subsoil contracts and licences, as mentioned in Annex E of the Strategy. More broadly, the EBRD supports EITI principles and requirements in accordance with the 2016 standard, including the stipulations on beneficial ownership.

12	<p>The Strategy should incorporate related recommendations, such as the OECD guidance providing a 5-step framework regarding what companies can do to source responsibly, addressing issues such as appropriate due diligence on supply chain actors.</p> <p>Mandatory disclosure under the EU Accounting and Transparency Directives and Canada’s ESTMA should be modified to include commodity sales, also addressed in relation to OECD policy dialogue on commodity trading transparency.</p>	<p>London written</p>	<p>The Bank carries out due diligence on all our clients to ensure that they source responsibly. Where supply chain weaknesses are identified, the Bank will either refuse a client or work with them to bring their operational standards into line with our requirements.</p>
13	<p>International environmental standards should be explicitly stated in the Strategy, especially in view of “green” transition objectives. EBRD to consider the International Council for Metals and Mining's (ICMM) strategies and guidelines.</p>	<p>London written</p>	<p>The Banks Environmental and Social Policy governs which standards apply. All projects must comply with local and EU environment-related regulations.</p>
14	<p>In terms of the relationship with other International Financial Institutions (IFIs), the Bank should take a strong position against any tendencies to water down standards for the sake of reducing red tape or increasing efficiencies in implementation, but instead play a role in keeping high standards for companies of all sizes.</p>	<p>London written</p>	<p>The Bank is committed to its policies and requirements, as are our partner IFIs, and is upholding these on an individual basis as well in any cooperation arrangements.</p>

15	<p>The Bank should aim at contributing to sustainable development through the way in which it assesses projects at the outset, that is before an investment decision is made, considering the (envisaged) impact of projects on economic development and balancing the pace in which projects are implemented in line with their value generation potential. The Bank should furthermore consider the mining industry's impacts on the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). National SDG documents should be incorporated into the Strategy and sustainable development mechanisms should be promoted. It should be taken into account that extractive developments in low-to middle-income countries were often linked with expectations that were too high and have led to a negative debt cycle. EBRD should follow the guidance outlined in the IFC/IEPCA/UNDP 'Mapping the Oil and Gas Industry to the SDGs: an Atlas' (2017). The Bank should develop indicators that measure EBRD's investments' impact on countries' progress in achieving their SDGs.</p>	<p>London Ulaanbaatar written</p>	<p>Sustainable development is central to EBRD's mandate. The Bank works in line with the priorities of the international community, such as the UN Sustainable Development Goals. One of the key principles governing the Bank's project activities is transition impact. In 2016, the Bank's transition concept was updated so that progress towards a sustainable market economy should now be considered against six key qualities: Competitive, Well-governed, Green, Inclusive, Resilient and Integrated. The contribution to transition, i.e. transition impact, of each project is assessed by the Bank as part of project decision-making, preparation and appraisal. Furthermore, in the development of the new Mining Strategy, the Bank has taken stock of recent developments in international standards. These include International Finance Corporation (IFC) and ICMM guidelines, and the Natural Resources Charter.</p>
16	<p>The Bank should introduce the Circular Economy concept in the Mining Strategy and consider recycling as a source of critical raw materials. The Bank should adjust the "green quality" accordingly.</p>	<p>written</p>	<p>The Green Economy Transition (GET) approach of the Bank includes a clear commitment to optimising the use of materials, which is particularly relevant in the mining sector. The Bank agrees with this suggestion. Reference to the Circular Economy related concepts is made on slide 11 and in Annex B of the Strategy.</p>
17	<p>The Generalised Scheme of Preferences (GSP) Plus Programme and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights should be monitored more closely.</p>	<p>Ulaanbaatar</p>	<p>Any project that the EBRD might consider must be compliant with national law, pertinent EU legislation and international standards. Issues relating to human rights at a project level are addressed through the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy.</p>

18	<p>It should be ensured that the impact of development plans at the national level is clearly defined in terms of how they relate to a country's Nationally Determined Contributions (NDCs), especially for energy-intensive mining industries, such as steel. Projects should be assessed against potential threats to already existing green growth plans, including a review of relevant specific concerns. The Bank should ensure adequate coordination internally, as well as with external parities (e.g. public authorities) in order to align plans from the beginning.</p>	London	<p>Assessing the consistency of individual projects with relevant national-level plans and strategies is an integral part of the Bank's environmental and social appraisal of projects. The national strategies and plans are reviewed and reflected as appropriate in the Bank's country strategies which are updated regularly. This includes review and identification of key environmental and social sustainability challenges and goals or targets in the national strategies and plans.</p>
19	<p>National action plans need to be developed to monitor mining activities. Stakeholders' capacity needs to be strengthened with EBRD's help.</p>	Istanbul	<p>The Bank uses policy engagement and technical cooperation tools to support stakeholders, including governments, in its countries of operations. Those tools can help develop such plans and capacity-building activities. In addition, the Bank closely monitors all its projects to ensure their compliance with the Bank's policies and requirements.</p>
20	<p>It should be defined more clearly, what kind of 'transition impact' the Bank hopes to achieve in countries that are making a transition to lower carbon processes, i.e. decarbonisation.</p>	London	<p>The EBRD sees transition to a low carbon economy as an integral part of our broader transition objectives. The Bank actively supports the development of projects which enable a green economy transition and decarbonisation of the economy. The Bank has adopted a target that by 2020, 40 per cent of its investments should support such a green transition, in line with its Green Economy Transition approach.</p>

21	<p>The Bank should take into consideration the projected development of different industry sectors and on that basis assess the feasibility of industrial plans (e.g. support iron ore mining that is connected with the steel industry). For example, - in relation to export commodities - consider risks related to the potential introduction of carbon tax or border adjustments in the main export markets.</p> <p>Accordingly, financial instruments should be elaborated to allow adjustment to price shocks. These instruments need to be classified and integrated according to the level of risk they represent and according to their relevance for individual countries. In this regard, the Bank should encourage clients to adopt a medium/long-term strategy taking into account amortisation policy as a basis for quality innovation and investment policy.</p>	London written	<p>The purpose of the Strategy is to set out a strategic vision of the Bank's operational priorities and approach in the mining sector over the next five-year period, rather than provide details for the implementation of particular projects or use of specific financial instruments. Such details would be discussed with (prospective) clients on a project-by-project basis. Throughout its operations the Bank is committed to the highest environmental and social standards in line with the Environmental and Social Policy and will promote transition according to the transition impact qualities as outlined on slide 14.</p>
22	<p>The Bank should present a breakdown of investment per mineral. This is because the demand for rare minerals (e.g. nickel) has increased with the uptake of green energy technologies. If available, data on investment per mineral should be included for the last strategy period along with an explanation for the high proportion of gold-mining investments compared to a relatively insignificant support for the supply of critical raw materials.</p>	London written	<p>Comment noted. This has been incorporated on slide 8 in the revised Strategy.</p> <p>Considerations regarding critical raw materials are discussed on slides 11, 17 and 25 (Annex B).</p>
23	<p>The investment approach in the mining industry generally indicates adherence to traditional modes of operation. Instead, global trends in the development of sectors that utilise rare and rare-earth elements should be considered more closely and the need for economic diversification should be addressed.</p>	written	<p>The Bank is well positioned to finance projects involving know-how-intensive minerals and critical raw materials including Rare Earth Metals (cf. slide 17). Through its country strategies, EBRD supports economic diversification and economic resilience in many of its countries of operations where dependence on the mining sector is an issue. The Bank's position is that this issue is best addressed on a country-by-</p>

			country basis, rather than in a sectoral approach.
24	It is necessary to systematically consider market trends and economic factors when developing policies that aim to effectively develop and manage the mineral and raw materials base in a given country.	written	Comment noted.
25	The Strategy should address the monetisation of greenhouse gas savings, and the Bank's role in engaging with state-owned enterprises/mines to adjust fiscal incentives accordingly by removing subsidies to generate an open playing field and encourage a shift towards minerals and greener technology options.	London	<p>The EBRD routinely assesses the greenhouse gas emissions of our projects. For certain types of projects, the Bank applies carbon pricing in its project appraisal processes. We are currently reviewing whether our approach to monetisation of greenhouse gas emissions should be developed further.</p> <p>The Bank's mandate promotes reform and privatisation of state-owned enterprises. In addition, we also encourage a Green Economy Transition where environmental considerations are integrated into our investments. Therefore we are supportive of the removal of environmentally harmful subsidies and policies, and advocate the introduction of appropriate incentives to green the economy.</p>
26	The Bank should align mining development with reforms in trade, education and infrastructure and help the economy of mining countries by building up value chains that have a cumulative effect.	London written	Comment noted. On slide 18 of the revised Strategy, the Bank demonstrates its Financial Support for value chain companies.

27	The Bank should support independent monitoring of the mining sector and promote greater stakeholder engagement and partnership with civil society organisations (CSOs). More training for CSOs in the field of transparency, especially financial transparency, is needed to make projects more productive.	Almaty Istanbul	The Bank's projects are monitored, by Bank experts and independent specialists, in line with the requirements of the EBRD's Environmental and Social Policy. In addition, the Bank is committed to closely engaging with CSOs. Through its Civil Society Capacity Building Framework, the Bank supports the transfer of skills and awareness raising among the local civil society sector in technical cooperation projects that are linked to specific EBRD-financed investments or policy engagement initiatives. Governance and transparency is one of the focus areas of the Bank's CSO capacity-building work.
28	Community development projects need to be strengthened and social licences should be established prior to operation.	Ulaanbaatar	Community engagement and consultation are addressed as part of the project appraisal process and are addressed in the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy.
29	EBRD should promote the creation and development of a network of postgraduate education and training mining production managers, aware of and taking into account global trends, political requirements and conditions for the development of the mineral market.	written	As part of its Economic Inclusion Strategy, the EBRD actively supports private sector representatives and sector associations to provide high-quality training opportunities in line with global trends and national legislation and regulations. Where applicable, this also includes supporting networks of experts, professionals or other sector representatives.
30	EBRD should consider playing a bigger role in the following areas: Support for private infrastructure with mines as anchor customers but with open access that can support mining (companies generally perceive that open access is politically desired).	written	Comment noted.

Environmental and social impacts

31	<p>There are tools and methods available for better measurement of social and environmental impacts, assessment of trade-offs, and cost-benefit analyses, e.g., total economic valuation exercises, to be considered in the new Strategy. The Strategy should promote a strategic approach to measuring and valuing these impacts in order to influence policy decisions on a more qualitative basis rather than only looking at revenues. The new Strategy should identify the best processes of evaluation to factor in other costs such as water, impact on local air quality and land value, impacts on landscaping, etc., and consider possible improvements to these evaluation processes. More investment in very early environmental and socio-economic assessments is needed including an area's/region's flora and fauna, its habitats and ecosystems and ecosystem services they provide and should also include soil/land rehabilitation.</p>	<p>London Ulaanbaatar Almaty written</p>	<p>The Bank requires (through its existing Environmental and Social Policy) that all project appraisals and impact assessments use current best practice and internationally recognised methods. This includes the value of environmental media.</p>
32	<p>More capacity building is necessary for monitoring environmental impact assessments. Audits are done every other year and often the assessments are not in-depth enough and need to be strengthened. Involve independent experts on biodiversity and geo-botanic investigation.</p>	<p>Ulaanbaatar written</p>	<p>In 2015 and 2016, the Bank built the capacity of environmental and social consultants in our countries of operations. Monitoring is carried out on all projects to a depth that depends on the risk profile of the project. High-risk projects are subject to site visits, often with independent consultants.</p>

33	<p>There is a call for a responsive EITI, moving towards greater openness and accountability for environmental and social impacts, such as climate change - beyond fiscal transparency. Examples include company contributions to environmental rehabilitation funds, environmental taxes, and social payments. The Bank should study and promote such good practice initiatives and overall compliance with EITI environmental obligations and standards. EBRD should look at examples where investments have had impacts beyond the remit of the project itself, such as in Mongolia and Botswana. In general, transparency considerations in the mining sector should include an environmental dimension.</p>	<p>London Ulaanbaatar Istanbul Almaty</p>	<p>The Bank requires that all projects in the extractives sector meet EBRD revenue transparency and accountability standards, which reflect the principle and objectives of the EITI.</p> <p>With regards to climate change, the Bank conducts climate change impact assessments in the course of project preparation and appraisal and will integrate climate resilience measures into project design where appropriate. Furthermore, environmental impact considerations are addressed through the Bank’s Environmental and Social Policy across all the Bank’s operations.</p>
34	<p>Prior to projects being initiated, more comprehensive baseline studies need to be made with more rigorous analysis conducted on biodiversity and ecosystem services. EBRD should also provide further assistance for water and waste management studies.</p>	<p>London Ulaanbaatar Almaty written</p>	<p>Baseline studies are always needed in line with the requirements of the Bank’s Environmental and Social Policy. This requires that local regulations, EU standards, and good international practices and standards are met. The Bank has stringent requirements for ESIA and will require additional studies if gaps are found in any baseline in terms of quality or the issues required to be addressed. Baseline assessments are addressed in the new Strategy (slide 9). The EBRD is engaging in policy dialogue with governments and environment ministries on water and waste management. The Bank can provide technical assistance to improve audit procedures.</p>
35	<p>The Bank should exclude mining investments in protected environmental areas. The Bank should consider “The UNESCO World Heritage Council’s “no-go” position and reflect it in the Strategy.</p>	<p>written</p>	<p>The EBRD does not rule out projects in sensitive zones but will assess potential impacts on the conservation objective of such zones. At times, the EBRD will fund projects in these zones because the project can do more to protect sensitive ecological resources than</p>

			would be the case if the Bank did not intervene. This issue is governed by the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy.
36	Audit mechanisms need to be applied to environmental issues.	Istanbul	The Bank carries out thorough environmental and social appraisal and monitoring of all projects in line with the requirements of the Environmental and Social Policy. This includes audit and analysis where appropriate.
37	The Bank should do more to support CO2 and pollutant accountability and general efforts to reduce CO2 emissions.	Almaty written	Reduction of greenhouse gases and other emissions is a key element of the Green Economy Transition (GET) approach, launched by the EBRD in 2015. Following the GET approach, the EBRD has implemented a robust measurement, reporting and verification system for tracking and reporting on GET impacts, including emission reductions.
38	The Strategy should outline clear objectives and targets with more specific details on what the Bank is trying to achieve or avoid with regard to biodiversity and ecosystem services , as well as robust monitoring of the implementation. For example, in following the mitigation hierarchy, there should be a clear objective of no net loss or net gain, etc. There are a number of positive elements in the previous Strategy that should be kept in the new Strategy, such as on mitigation hierarchy , mine closure finance, etc.	London written	The Bank's requirements in this regard are defined in the Environmental and Social Policy. The principle of No Net Loss applies.

39	<p>Human rights issues should be addressed in detail in the Strategy. It is important to understand accountability not only as for payments and revenues, but broaden accountability to citizens for the impacts of mining, and most importantly to include government accountability for citizens' right to free association and to participate without interference, harassment or obstruction in public debates and decisions about extractive operations, impacts, resources and revenues. Critical voices should have an opportunity to be heard.</p> <p>A holistic approach in the new Strategy is recommended to give greater recognition of the potential damage to livelihoods and human rights, possibly including indigenous peoples' rights to Free Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) over mining projects. It is important to have an active pro human rights policy that promotes good practice in every respect.</p>	<p>London Ulaanbaatar Almaty written</p>	<p>These issues are addressed in the Environmental and Social Policy. Also see Comment/EBRD response No. 72.</p>
40	<p>Labour rights violations should be collected and analysed in a more systematic manner. Cooperation with trade unions should be considered in this respect, however, bearing in mind that not all trade unions are independent. Workers' input is essential.</p>	<p>Almaty</p>	<p>Labour issues are appraised and monitored for all Bank projects. Consultation with both union representatives and individual employees is carried out as deemed appropriate to the risk profile of the country/sector/client. This issue is governed by the Bank's Environmental Policy.</p>
41	<p>Investment should be linked with requirements for data collection and accurate public reporting on the number of women employed in mining (from government departments, agencies, or companies with which the Bank works). More accurate data could help increase and improve the participation of women in the sector.</p>	<p>London</p>	<p>EBRD Performance Requirement 2 (Labour and Working Conditions, section 9: Non-discrimination and equal opportunity) requires clients to demonstrate policy and processes which ensure women and men are given equal opportunities within operations. This includes producing gender disaggregated data during baseline assessment and monitoring. At the EBRD's request, clients are increasingly committing to making</p>

			these data public in their annual reporting, in line with initiatives such as Global Reporting Initiative Standards and Women's Empowerment Principles.
42	Gender issues need to be integrated throughout strategies, not just in selected areas. More efforts need to be made to promote gender equality with more involvement of the local communities in the process and clearly stated Gender Policy Requirements.	Almaty Ulaanbaatar written	The question of gender equality is addressed in the EBRD's Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality, which mandates the Bank to strengthen gender equality across its operations.
43	While the monitoring of social impact is challenging and lacking at times, the Bank should promote community rights in social development and decision-making processes.	Istanbul	Stakeholder engagement and public consultation are key elements of project appraisal processes. The Bank's Environmental and Social Policy outlines the requirements for this and the ongoing requirements for engagement throughout the life cycle of a project.
44	The Strategy should give consideration to people affected by occupational/economic displacement due to mining and provide adequate compensation.	Ulaanbaatar written	Economic displacement is addressed under the Environmental and Social Policy and appropriate remedies are required.
45	The land registry is deficient and the refugee crisis is exacerbating this. Resettlement is not well understood and an ongoing dialogue needs to be established.	Istanbul	This issue is addressed under the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy.
46	Licensing and permitting criteria should be established with better monitoring of companies who receive licences and permits. The permitting and licensing procedures should address human rights issues and should be made clear at a local level.	Istanbul Ulaanbaatar	The Bank's requirements for project monitoring are outlined in detail in the Environmental and Social Policy. Issues involving licensing and permitting are the responsibility of local and/or national governments.
47	Stakeholder engagement should be strengthened, especially in the areas of HSE and labour rights issues. New technologies and training are needed in HSE issues and labour rights need to be better communicated to workers. More information needs to be shared among stakeholders,	Almaty Istanbul	The Bank's Environmental and Social Policy addresses these issues. There are requirements in terms of training and the dissemination of information to employees and the public. The Bank encourages improvements in environmental health and safety and

	i.e. annual reports and other corporate documentation.		social reporting.
48	It is recommended to look at the complete life cycle of the investments in order to consider environmental impacts throughout the different project phases, including the planning, production, and post-project stages, especially taking into account the environmental concerns after the mine is closed. EBRD should encourage more engagement in every phase and level. Mine closure plans needs to be developed sooner and evaluated rather than when they go into force and mine remediation/reclamation need to be considered more fully with much more local level engagement, implementation alternatives need to be considered as well.	London Ulaanbaatar Almaty written	The Bank's appraisal process addresses the entire project life cycle.
49	The Bank should apply action plans to deal with legacy issues over old mines and to make decisions on site selection for new mines, which also needs to be better communicated to local stakeholders. International, not just national environmental standards should apply in this respect.	Istanbul	The Bank's project appraisal process includes consideration of the potential for environmental and social impacts from existing conditions and new developments. In addition, this appraisal must consider not only local requirements, but also EU standards and best international practice.
50	Currently, pollution and soil waste management are not being addressed adequately, which negatively affects farmers. Yearly analysis of effects on farming is required.	Istanbul	Project appraisal and monitoring includes impacts on neighbouring and off-site land users. It also addresses all environmental media, including those listed in the comment. Monitoring is carried out on all projects at least annually.
51	The Strategy should be aligned with the latest legislation at the international level (e.g. EU legislation). In particular, for the peer review processes , it is important to seek external environmental expert opinion in addition to the internal EBRD review by the Environment and Sustainability Department. Local experts should be engaged during the	London	All projects are appraised against current local and EU regulations, and where there is no regulation, against current international best practice. For all high-risk projects, independent review is carried out, including by local experts where required.

	public consultation process as well as for the life cycle analysis.		
Competitive			
52	Mining operators need to do more on R&D and work with local research institutes to develop more training opportunities.	Almaty	Comment noted and further addressed in the economic inclusion sections.
53	It is necessary to contribute to an increase in the share of R&D expenditures through stimulating private, large, and growing small/medium sized businesses.	written	Comment noted.
54	It is necessary to establish an effective science and innovation system for all mining countries, and to promote cluster development principles. Countries are currently not doing enough to promote their science and innovation systems.	written	Comment noted.
55	Although energy issues are not addressed within this Strategy, from an environmental perspective it must be acknowledged that mining and quarrying are highly emission-intensive fields.	London	Comment noted. The Bank acknowledges the extent to which mining and quarrying contributes towards emissions (see slides 13-14).
Green			
56	Ecosystem-based adaptations should be considered in the Strategy when it comes to climate change to use nature as part of the solution, including specific examples of such adaptations.	London written	During the preparation of mining sector investments, the Bank assesses climate change impacts where appropriate, to integrate climate resilience measures into project design. In some cases, these may include ecosystem-based adaptation approaches, such as afforestation to reduce the risk of extreme precipitation runoff events.

57	Green technology investment should be a priority.	Almaty	The EBRD supports and promotes green technology and encourages investments in this area through its transition impact methodology.
58	EBRD should promote better sustainable construction practices as well as “green label” use and development.	Ulaanbaatar	The EBRD strongly promotes internationally recognised standards and certification schemes, including “green” product labels, certifications and ratings for sustainable practices and management.
59	It is important to ensure that stranded assets (e.g. coal) are avoided and to promote renewable energy while noting the limitations of base load and the importance of integrating with the grid. The Strategy should clarify how the Bank addresses stranded assets and which mechanisms are put in place to address longer-term risks.	written	Comments noted. The Mining Strategy does not address the Bank's approach to assets such as coal. The 2013 Energy Strategy, planned to be revised in 2018, will include a wider debate on energy usage and cleaner energy solutions.
Inclusive			
60	Dependence on mining resource revenue should be considered and alternatives sought for the long term sustainable development of regions and communities affected after the closure of mines. The new Strategy should lay out the skills development of people working in mines in order to help them transition into other industries after mine closure. The Bank should also invest in other economic activities parallel to the mining activities to support transition post-closure.	London	In accordance with its Economic Inclusion Strategy, the EBRD actively helps its clients to improve their supply chain management and increase supplier diversity. This is typically achieved through upskilling local people in cross-sectoral technical disciplines as well as providing advisory services to local small businesses. In turn, this contributes to the development of resilient local enterprises with connections going beyond mining operations.

61	<p>Clarification is required on the gender-related terms used in the Strategy, such as gender-sensitive mining issues. It is recommended to broaden the focus of the Strategy to also include women educated and skilled in geotechnical and mining-related fields as well as occupying professional roles in management, legal, and finance.</p>	London	<p>The EBRD's Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality (SPGE) mandates the Bank to strengthen gender equality across its operations. One priority theme in the SPGE is to strengthen women's access to employment and skills, particularly where women are heavily under-represented, such as in the natural resources sector in general, and operations jobs which require STEM training at TVET level in particular. Evidence of Bank progress in this area can be seen in the commitment of mining clients and policy dialogue in Kazakhstan to support young women across the country to apply to TVET courses in the areas of greatest need and opportunity in the natural resources and power and energy sectors, thereby building the pipeline of women with TVET qualifications relevant to high-value sectors.</p>
62	<p>The Strategy should aim to address the reasons why women do not start mining companies linked to issues of access to finance and investor confidence, as well as develop ways to identify and enable female mining entrepreneurs. Mining legislation should be geared towards unlocking the potential of women by incorporating, protecting, and advancing women in the sector. The Bank can influence such a direction through policy dialogue.</p>	London	<p>The EBRD's SPGE mandates the Bank to strengthen gender equality across its operations. The Strategy is operationalised at project level by strengthening, wherever practical, women's access to employment and skills, finance and services. Through these measures, women and women-led businesses are better able to compete equally with men for jobs and benefits which emerge from mining. Evidence of Bank progress in this area can be seen in the commitment of a mining client in Turkey to extend its equal opportunities policy throughout its supply chain.</p>
63	<p>Local hiring should be encouraged taking into account particular needs to meet job requirements in terms of education and skills.</p>	Almaty	<p>As part of its Economic Inclusion Strategy, the EBRD actively supports its clients to establish high-quality, accredited, life-long learning programmes for local community representatives in order to increase their</p>

			employability in mining operations.
64	People with disability are underrepresented in the labour force. In this respect the Bank should promote global standards in hiring and training in the mining sector.	Almaty	In line with its Economic Inclusion Strategy, the EBRD is currently exploring the possibility of expanding its inclusion activities to people with disabilities.
65	The Bank should take into account good practice examples of successful initiatives regarding downstream linkages (Newmont in Ghana and Anglo American South Africa).	London	The Bank frequently reviews international best practices, particularly in relation to human capital and its connection to domestic technological capabilities. In relation to developing downstream industries' investment in education and training (especially engineering and vocational skills), key factors include strong public-private partnerships, and the alignment of different policy tools, including industrial and human capital strategies.
66	Supply chain tracking needs to be better established. Exploitation of immigrants and the poor is common.	Almaty	The Bank is currently reviewing several alternatives, which go beyond the Global Reporting Initiative standards in terms of tracking the supply chain engagement of mining investments.
67	Correct discrepancy between defining the "inclusion" quality on slide 14 and on slide 7 – Unfortunately, the definition on slide 7 doesn't reflect inclusion of local communities. Include a clear indication of "partnerships with communities" (slide 15) under the inclusive transition quality and examples where effective remedy was provided to local complaints.	written	The definition on slide 7 has a reference to "populations living in underserved areas". Each mining project typically undertakes substantial consultation with local communities and identifies areas and mechanisms through which the project can best address the needs of local communities. In that context, "partnership with communities" (slide 15) will be clarified further.

Well-governed

68	<p>Reference to contract transparency in the Strategy should not only promote disclosure in general but also address the relevant details on the mode and timing of the disclosure, i.e. full contract disclosure should be included, with amendments within a specified time frame, and accessibility online in an open data format.</p> <p>The Bank should also specify the conditions under which clients can provide a summary instead of the principal contract or license as this will help strengthen the public transparency requirement. Furthermore, with regards to the summary of any significant stabilization clauses, it should be defined what is considered as significant. In general, more information should be provided on all stabilization clauses.</p> <p>The Bank should also solicit more transparency in Prime Collateralised Securities (PCS) and other financial instruments.</p>	<p>London Ulaanbaatar Istanbul written</p>	<p>Comments noted. Annex E of EBRD draft Strategy sets out the Bank's approach to contract transparency. The Bank encourages its clients to make subsoil contracts and licences public, while ensuring commercially proprietary information is not included. The Bank encourages its clients to disclose contracts and licences as soon as practically possible. (For example, this could be through continuous online disclosures or, where available, by publishing additional contextual EITI data that is more recent than the accounting period covered by the EITI revenue data.)</p> <p>Upon signing of the legal agreements with EBRD, among other things, the Bank's clients also undertake to comply with the EBRD Performance Requirement 10 on Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure. The EBRD is committed to openness and transparency as a basic principle of its engagement with stakeholders while safeguarding the business approach to implementing its mandate.</p>
69	<p>There are linkages between the transparency and accountability agenda and broader issues of human rights and environmental sustainability, therefore, a holistic approach is required. The Bank should support and protect safeguards for civil society participation, recognising that one of the primary purposes of the EITI is to make the extractive industry accountable to civil society and ensure stakeholder engagement from an early stage.</p>	<p>London written</p>	<p>The Bank is committed to the principles of the EITI and supports accountability and transparency through its investment projects, policy engagement and technical cooperation activities. The EBRD's engagement with civil society is designed to support the Bank's mandate of fostering transition towards well-functioning market economies in countries that are committed to and apply the principles of democracy and pluralism. At a project level, the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy and Performance Requirement 10 set out</p>

			specific stakeholder engagement requirements.
70	<p>The Strategy should recognise the importance of voluntary reporting under the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI) and mandatory reporting regimes, e.g. the mandatory reporting rules according to the EU Accounting and Transparency Directives and Canada’s ESTMA, and ensure effective implementation through the supported projects by promoting high quality reporting standards and company compliance. Voluntary EITI reporting should include local content plans/reports, environmental and social impact assessments, management plans, workforce data desegregated by gender, etc. Public disclosure of EITI and mandatory reports will allow CSOs to better monitor the sector. The Strategy should ensure that there are no double standards applied to EU and non-EU companies.</p>	London written	<p>The Bank requires its clients to comply with any mandatory reporting rules to which they are subject, including EITI, EU Accounting and Transparency Directives and Canada’s ESTMA. In addition, the Bank requires its clients to comply with its own revenue transparency and accountability standards, and encourages clients to go beyond these to further EBRD transition impact in a given country.</p>
71	<p>The Bank should recognise that there are other avenues for countries to promote transparency other than the EITI. The Bank should work with governments to promote accountability and transparency, adapted to the local situation in respective countries, considering EITI as one possible tool but not as the single most important compliance standard.</p>	Istanbul	<p>The Bank supports the EITI and the key principles it enshrines. At the same time, a country’s EITI membership is not a condition for the Bank to support projects in its extractive sector. However, we require our clients to comply with revenue transparency and accountability standards. Beyond the EITI, the Bank works with its clients and the governments of its countries of operations to promote transparency and accountability with a variety of policy dialogue and technical cooperation tools.</p>

72	The ‘well-governed’ quality should also include respect for human rights, alongside the promotion of transparency and regulatory reforms.	written	At an investment project level, the Bank, in accordance with its Environmental and Social Policy, recognises the responsibility of its clients and their respective business activities to respect human rights. Regarding human rights and freedom of association at a country level, the EBRD’s political mandate is set by its Article 1 of the Agreement Establishing the Bank, in accordance with which the Bank’s Management and Board closely monitor political developments in all countries in which the Bank is engaged.
Key comments related to specific regions or countries			
73	Human rights violations are a major issue in Mongolia and conflicts tend to arise in local areas with herders and within ethnic minority groups, according to the CSO comment.	Ulaanbaatar	These issues are addressed in the Bank’s Environmental and Social Policy.
74	<p>Government instability or lack of continuity due to rapid succession hinders transparency of policy making and implementation and makes the mining industry dependent on the state, which in turn challenges the transparency of the sector. Despite adequate political frameworks, public procurement authorities are subject to political pressures. CSO’s policy advocacy efforts often remain without results.</p> <p>Furthermore, a lack of access to information and lack of accountability encourage corruption. For example in Mongolia, the Mining Law has been revised so many times that the “exceptions” to the law have stifled transparency.</p> <p>The Strategy should mention that increased capacity of regulatory authorities would improve the social impact of mining and ensure the protection of human, gender and</p>	Ulaanbaatar, Almaty, Istanbul, written	<p>As part of its mandate, the EBRD monitors the political situation in the countries where it operates. When a country strategy is revised, a complete political assessment is carried out; in the course of which 14 separate criteria are assessed, including criteria around representative government, civil society, media and participation.</p> <p>To help address transparency, accountability and corporate governance challenges, the EBRD supports a number of sector-specific initiatives. Through its policy dialogue and technical cooperation activities, the Bank provides support intended to help national authorities improve stability, increase predictability and enable greater transparency in the legal, regulatory, operational and financial aspects of the sector. In</p>

	community rights.		<p>conjunction with its investment projects, this promotes responsible and inclusive mining operations.</p> <p>In particular, the EBRD supports the implementation of EITI in a number of countries, both regionally and on an individual country basis, including in Mongolia, the Kyrgyz Republic, Armenia and Kazakhstan. The EBRD is also supporting the preparation of a new law on mining in Mongolia. When adopted, it is hoped that the law will be able to provide greater legal certainty and enhance transparency in the sector. At the investment project level, the Bank promotes best international governance standards and practices and so aims to support transition to better governance and transparency in the sector.</p>
75	<p>In Kazakhstan, vocational training, while well-developed, needs to be broadened nationally and tied to basic educational standards and resources available.</p> <p>In Mongolia, the quality of vocational training should be improved and made a priority. Curricula should be more human rights focused.</p>	Almaty Ulaanbaatar	<p>In Kazakhstan, in May 2017, the Bank launched a comprehensive programme to bring together employers and education providers in natural resources and energy sectors. The aim was to improve the quality of education and align it with the requirements of employers and international best practice. The Bank is currently exploring several opportunities to launch similar programmes in other countries of operations.</p>
76	<p>Many countries, such as Kazakhstan, do not have a systematic/strategic/in-depth industrial policy for the development of mining industries: there are no concepts of subsoil use and for the development of mining and of the metallurgical industry in the long term that would benefit the society as a whole. The EBRD should support a balanced consideration of the interests of different stakeholder in the field of mineral raw materials: society,</p>	written Almaty	<p>Every project financed by the EBRD, whether within or outside the mining industry, has to comply with the Performance Requirements (PRs) of the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy. PR1, PR2, PR5 and PR7 address the issues raised in this comment.</p>

	state, producers and investors.		
77	In Kazakhstan, a system of technical and technological audit should be developed at the political, organisational and legislative levels. Effective tools and mechanisms for technical and technological audit should be proposed for the purpose of qualitative and targeted technological modernisation of the industry.	written Almaty	The Bank uses policy engagement and technical cooperation tools to support stakeholders, including companies and authorities at different levels. This can help develop mechanisms aimed at improving areas such as standards and the investment climate.
78	Some comments expressed interested in working with the EBRD on projects in Kazakhstan that contribute to improving corporate governance and corporate social responsibility.	written Almaty	Comment noted. The relevant contact details have been shared.
79	Evaluating mining performance requires assessments to be divided into two groups: metal and marble. Marble mining plays a significant role in Turkey.	Istanbul	Comment noted.
80	The “Green” criterion should be revisited and revised to reflect the poor environmental understanding and practices regarding gold mines in Turkey.	written	All projects that the EBRD invests in are required to meet the requirements of the Bank’s Environmental and Social Policy. We are aware of sector-wide issues relating to mining across our countries of operations, and all such issues are thoroughly reviewed as part of the project appraisal process. It should be noted that greenfield developments in the sector are not considered as ‘green’.