

# Evaluation of Almaty Transport Integrated Approach



EBRD Evaluation department  
2017

This study evaluates €107 million financing provided by the EBRD to Almaty Electrotrans for electrical substations, improved services, a project for bus sector reform and trolleybuses. During its work with Almaty Electrotrans, the EBRD developed an integrated approach to increase the capacity and standards of urban transport and increase viable travel choices for users.

## The EBRD's integrated approach

The EBRD adopted the integrated approach to project development in 2009 in a response to a need to leverage greater transition impact within sectors. It aims to address weaknesses in institutional underpinnings of the market across the region with more precision.

An integrated approach binds together a series of projects with a consistent and coherent set of transition principles with associated policy dialogue and technical assistance measures to enhance the EBRD's potential impact in a sector.

The approach is used selectively in circumstances which warrant additional skills, time and resources.

## Almaty Electrotrans & the EBRD

Almaty Electrotrans is a municipal tram and trolleybus company in Almaty, Kazakhstan.

The EBRD provided €107 million for electrical substations and improved services, bus sector reform and trolleybuses. The integrated approach was adopted after an initial financing of the electrical substations and improved services, and included technical cooperation and policy dialogue.

## Evaluation approach

This evaluation follows the OECD DAC methodology, analysing and rating the relevance, results and efficiency of the EBRD's projects with Almaty Electrotrans. The evaluation team conducted a site visit and interviews with company representatives and the EBRD project team.

Evaluation questions included:

- ✓ How did individual investments and technical assistance perform?
- ✓ Has an integrated approach combining investments, technical cooperation and policy dialogue produced better results than would have otherwise been the case?
- ✓ Has private sector participation in the Almaty urban transport sector increased and why or why not?

## Findings

**There was significant over reliance on technical cooperation for achievement of transition impact.** Five out of six identified outcomes could be traced back to technical cooperation initiatives. Though some technical cooperation components proceeded as planned, many did not materialise or performed below expectations, resulting in many transition outcomes and impacts not being achieved.

**Policy dialogue activities were unclear.** The EBRD intended to employ policy dialogue as part of the integrated approach, however activities were not specified or documented.

**The measures were strategically aligned.** The projects contributed to commercialisation and environmental improvement. They added to EBRD's scarce support for municipal infrastructure in Kazakhstan.

**Progress was made to promote gender equality.** The EBRD identified measures during due diligence to promote equal opportunities in the sector and reduce gender gaps. The first female bus driver was recruited in 2016.



---

## Recommendations

### Improving design of integrated approaches

Where projects are presented as part of an integrated approach, expected transition impact from each operational component should be specifically identified (including from investments, technical cooperation, policy dialogue and client commitment). The purpose is to provide clarity and better risk assessment, management, monitoring and reporting, particularly in cases where most expected transition impact is derived from a single source (such as technical cooperation provided largely by consultants).

### Specifying policy dialogue measures

Given the centrality of policy dialogue to an integrated approach, a structured and systematic approach to policy dialogue should be provided at approval, with clear identification of problems to be addressed, actions to be taken, and objectives to be reached.

Read the summary at [www.ebrd.com/evaluation](http://www.ebrd.com/evaluation).



---

## Contacts

European Bank for Reconstruction  
and Development  
One Exchange Square  
London EC2A 2JNUK  
Tel: +44 20 7338 6000  
Fax: +44 20 7338 7848

Joe Eichenberger  
Chief Evaluator, Evaluation department  
European Bank for Reconstruction  
and Development  
Tel: +44 207 338 6107  
Email: [eichenbj@ebrd.com](mailto:eichenbj@ebrd.com)

Further information  
[www.ebrd.com/evaluation](http://www.ebrd.com/evaluation)

