
APPROACH PAPER

2013 Annual Evaluation Review

December 2013

EBRD EVALUATION DEPARTMENT



European Bank
for Reconstruction and Development

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY. This document has a restricted internal distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without the Bank's authorisation

Contents

1. Introduction.....	1
1.1 Summary of Intended Work	
1.2 Basis for the report	
2. Scope and methodology	2
2.1 Scope	
2.1.1 <i>Evaluation questions</i>	
2.2 Proposed methods	
3. Administrative arrangements	4
3.1 EvD team	
3.2 Peer reviewers	
3.3 Timetable	
3.4 Budget	

Annex 1: Outline Table of Contents for AER 2013

1. Introduction

1.1 Summary of Intended Work

The Annual Evaluation Review (AER) is the Evaluation Department's (EvD's) annual report to the Board and Management on evaluation in the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD). It reports on results and findings from evaluations delivered in 2013 and updates trend data on the performance of the EBRD's operations with the latest batch of evaluation results. It fulfils three requirements:

- The EBRD Evaluation Policy approved by the Board in January 2013 requires EvD to report annually to the Board on the performance of the evaluation system in the EBRD and the results and findings it produces.
- The AER reflects relevant sections of the Good Practice Standards (GPS) for Private Sector Evaluation of the Evaluation Cooperation Group of which EvD is a member. Relevant GPS are Principle 6 relating to the annual reporting of corporate results, and Principle 7 relating to periodic reporting on the evaluation system.
- As agreed by the Audit Committee at its meeting of 24 October 2011, The AER also now includes the formerly standalone Work Programme Completion Report.

Over the last three years the AER has sought to focus on issues of strategic importance and to extract insights from more selectively presented data. This evolution will continue with the current report. The report will:

- Meet accountability requirements by providing aggregate time-series data on the post-evaluated performance of EBRD operations, with disaggregation along a number of dimensions;
- To extent possible, explain the performance trends observed
- Summarise the main findings and lessons from 2013 evaluations and situate these in the context of previous findings;
- Report on two 'special themes' identified for this year's reports – these are detailed in section 2.1(v) of this paper;
- Present a stocktaking of evaluation in the EBRD with a description of new developments
- Report on EvD activities and deliveries, and;
- Draw conclusions and, if judged necessary, make recommendations based on these.

1.2 Basis for the report

The AER 2013 will be based on the following:

- Evaluation reports circulated to the Board in 2013;

- Time series data on the performance of EBRD operations from a database maintained by EvD;
- Data from these two sources has been supplemented by that drawn from other EvD records;
- Original research carried out by analysts and evaluation managers for AER 2013.

The available information has been analysed to answer a series of evaluation questions outlined in section 2.

2. Scope and methodology

2.1 Scope

The AER 2013 will cover:

- i) Annual reporting of corporate results (as per the Evaluation Policy requirement and GPS Principle 6):
 - An assessment of the EBRD's corporate-wide performance, based on the findings from project-level evaluations;
 - Detailed aggregate results from evaluations and validations conducted as part of the 2013 work programme. For each rating dimension and indicator, the AER reports the number and proportion of the evaluated cohort in each performance-rating category;
 - A description of the ratings patterns and their performance drivers under each indicator. Data is generally presented as rolling three-year averages by year of Board approval. Rolling three year averages are used to better illustrate trends, if any. The AER 2011 introduced a change to present results by year of Board approval rather than by year of evaluation as previously to better illustrate possible contextual causes of observed performance trends;
 - Explanations for observed performance trends to the extent possible;
 - Recommendations arising from the above, if any;
 - Details of the evaluation sample: how the population was defined, the sampling methodology used, the extent to which the sample's characteristics reflect those of the population, and the sampling errors in the reported success rates (to be an annex in the AER).
- ii) Reporting on findings:
 - A synthesis of key findings from evaluations distributed to the Board of Directors in 2013.
 - Broad themes and issues arising from 2013 evaluation findings with these situated in the context of previous evaluation findings to indicate where these support and build on previous findings or provide new areas of learning.
 - Conclusions of the Audit Committee on the EvD reports and documents it considered.
 - Further recommendations arising from the above, if any.

iii) Periodic reporting on evaluation systems (as per GPS Principle 7):

The GPS require evaluation departments to report at least every three years on the following aspects - EvD chooses to do so every year to the extent that available information allows.

- A report on the functioning and effectiveness of the EBRD's monitoring and evaluation systems, including self-evaluation.
- A review of the evaluability of EBRD operations. This is undertaken as one of the 'special themes' as outlined in section 2.1(v) below.
- A review of the extent to which strategies, policies and other relevant Management documents have results frameworks that render them evaluable. No structured piece of work is envisaged here because Management is currently working to make its policies and strategies more results-focussed so a review should await implementation of new guidance in this area. EvD will seek to support this work in an advisory role.
- An assessment of the extent to which findings and lessons from evaluation are applied in new operations. This is undertaken as one of the 'special themes' as outlined in section 2.1(v) below.

iv) EvD Performance Report for 2013:

- Report on the fulfilment of the Evaluation Department's work programme for 2013 as established in Board document BDS13-109 (Cor 1) – EvD's delivery of outputs
- Description of initiatives to improve EvD performance
- Summary of contributions by EvD to bankwide initiatives and engagement with Management.
- Details of any other activities of the Evaluation Department, including dissemination of findings, training, and networking with the international evaluation community.

v) Special Themes

- Each AER may include in-depth review of a specific theme(s) arising from previous AERs, other EvD work, or specific requests received related to overall performance of the Bank and its operations. For AER 2013 the AER will include two specific pieces of work:
 - An evaluability assessment of Board approved projects for a single quarter of 2013
 - A preliminary assessment of the quality of technical cooperation (TC) submissions under the new results framework

2.1.1 Evaluation questions

The AER will address the following questions:

- Based on the results of project-level evaluation in 1996-2013 (sorted by year of operation approval) and longer term trends, what are we able to say about the overall performance of the Bank?
- What have been the key drivers of overall performance?
- What are areas of particular strength or weakness?

- What are the key findings from evaluations distributed to the Board of Directors in 2013, what common themes emerge and do these support or contradict earlier evaluation findings or do they canvass new territory?
- Are further recommendations merited based on the above?
- How effectively implemented are the EBRD's monitoring and evaluation systems, including self-evaluation?
- What can we say about the evaluability of EBRD operations?
- To what extent are findings and lessons from evaluation applied in new operations?
- Should EvD make changes to the way it selects projects for evaluation?
- How well are submissions for approval of new technical cooperation operations applying the new results framework introduced in 2013 and how can the quality be enhanced?
- How effective and efficient is EvD on delivering on its work programme and contributing to better institutional performance?

2.2 Proposed methods

Methods will include:

- Review of evaluations distributed to the Board of Directors in 2013
- Review of Audit Committee and Board discussions in 2013
- Discussion of evaluation findings with relevant Evaluation Managers
- Aggregation and analysis of ratings from evaluations and validations conducted as part of the 2013 work programme
- Comparison of results from operations performance assessments (OPAs) and Transition Impact Monitoring System (TIMS) reviews with results from EvD's evaluations and validations
- Review of project documents submitted to the Board to assess evaluability of projects and the quality of lessons/past experience
- Review of project documents submitted to the TC Committee to assess their quality under the new results framework
- Discussions as necessary with Banking and support departments in the Bank

The output will be in the form of a report for discussion by the Audit Committee and the Board of Directors.

3. Administrative arrangements

3.1 EvD team

Study leader: Victoria Millis

Team members: Saeed Ibrahim (chapters 2, 3, 5)

Shireen El-Wahab (chapter 4)

Karin Becker (layout, editing, presentation)

3.2 Peer reviewers

Internal reviewers: Keith Leonard

3.3 Timetable

EvD has undertaken to deliver the AER to the Audit Committee before the 2014 Annual Meeting (14-15 May 2014).

Milestone	Date (by week)
Study starts	
Approach paper approved	III Dec 2013
Draft circulated to internal peer reviewer	WC 10 March 2014
Draft to Chief Evaluator	WC 24 March 2014
Final approved by Chief Evaluator	WC 7 April 2014
Circulation to Management for MCs	WC 7 April 2014
Editing for external publication	WC 7 April 2014
Formatting for external publication	WC 21 April 2014
Circulation of Final to Audit Committee and Board	WC 28 April 2014
Web posting	WC 5 May
Printing	WC 5 May
Annual meeting presentation	14 May 2014
Audit Committee presentation if requested	tbc

Following approval of the final version by the Chief Evaluator, editing and formatting for external publication will begin alongside the process of circulating the report for Management Comments and then to the Audit Committee and Board.

All charts must be provided to the formatting team in editable Excel format.

Cross referencing and TOC with hyperlinks will be used in the final formatted version, along with bookmarking and a web version with annexes divided. Photo heading pages will split chapter headings.

Presentations

1. Evaluation department staff meeting
2. Annual Meeting (space in the agenda permitting)
3. Audit Committee

3.4 Budget

No travel or consultancy budget is required for preparation of this study. Travel to the Annual Meeting will be required for staff presenting the report.

Annex 1: Outline Table of Contents for AER 2013

The section headings may change depending upon the results of the analysis conducted. The report will only cover the most salient features.

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Purpose of the report
- 1.2 Key messages

2. Aggregate performance

- 2.1 How operations are evaluated in the EBRD
- 2.2 Overall performance
- 2.3 Breakdown of overall performance
- 2.4 The relevance of Bank projects
- 2.5 The effectiveness and efficiency of Bank projects
- 2.6 The impact and sustainability of Bank projects

3. Findings from evaluation in the 2013 work programme

- 3.1 Introduction
- 3.2 [key theme identified from the 2013 work programme]
- 3.3 [key theme identified from the 2013 work programme]
- 3.4 [key theme identified from the 2013 work programme]
- 3.5 Audit Committee review of EvD reports

4. Special themes for AER 2013

- 4.1 Evaluability assessment of Board approved projects in 2013
- 4.3 Preliminary quality assessment of TC submissions under the new results framework

5. Review of self-evaluation and monitoring at the EBRD

- 5.1 Introduction
- 5.2 The quality of self-evaluation
- 5.3 Impact monitoring of investment operations

2013 Annual Evaluation Review

6. Highlights and challenges of the evaluation year

6.1 Update on strategic initiatives

6.2 Engagement with the international evaluation community

Annexes

Annex 1: Selection of investment projects for evaluation

Annex 2: Evaluated performance of projects by year of approval

Annex 3: [support material to chapter 4]

Annex 4: Work programme completion report for 2013